

#### Main topics

Given a set of jobs subject to **time** and **resource** constraints that have to be completed **as soon as possible** 

#### how to solve a scheduling problem

how to decide when to start/complete each job such that - all constraints (resource + time constraints) are satisfied,

- all objectives are met.

#### how to distribute a scheduling problem

how to ensure that a scheduling problem can be decomposed and parts can be solved independently.



# Our global plan

- maintenance scheduling: a simple example.
- **specifying** maintenance scheduling problems.
- **solving** scheduling problems.
- **distributing** problems over independent teams.
- demo of a tool for maintenance scheduling.





### Example: train maintenance













atypical profiles of wi The machine tool can be operated by one ope adequate text-graphics images, which are displa with a diagnostics of the lathe's operating cond edures of their elir

nomical, efficient and accurate.

mark the job as done;

end

(prove it yourself)



#### Remarks about the example

- The algorithm we showed is very efficient, but requires an **unbounded number** of specialists.
- If there is only **one** (1) specialist as resource, there is also an efficient algorithm to find the best schedule.
- If there is a bounded number of specialists (>1), we don't know an efficient algorithm, yet.

In fact, you will earn **\$1.000.000** by finding it!

http://www.claymath.org/millennium/



### Remarks about the example

- To solve the problem with a bounded number of specialists, we have to rely on enumerating all possibilities.
   (10 jobs gives 3,6 x10<sup>6</sup> possibilities 20 jobs gives 2,4 x 10<sup>18</sup> possibilities ).
- Such problems are assumed to be intractable problems.
- Most scheduling problems are suspected to be intractable.

That's why we need to think hard to "solve" them ...













- $x_{i,t}$  is a binary variable taking value 1 if job j is completed at time t and 0 else,
- $x_{n+1,t}$  is a dummy job such that all jobs precede it,
- -H is an upperbound on the makespan.

17 **ŤU**Delft

### Scheduling: complexity

#### Problem specification 1

- set of linear time constraints
- set of resource constraints
- objective: minimize makespan

**NP-hard problem** 

**Resource Constrained** 

**Project Scheduling Problem** 

(RCPSP)





# Simple Temporal Problem

(STP)



WCMC Summerschool 2013



#### **Simple Temporal Problems**

A Simple Temporal Problem (**STP**) is a tuple S = (T, C) where

- T is a set of (time) variables

- C is a set of binary constraints of the form  $t' - t \le \delta$ , where  $\delta$  is an arbitrary constant.

A solution to an **STP** S = (T, C) is an assignment  $\{t_i = v_i : t_i \in T\}$  of values (times) to all variables in T such that all constraints in C are satisfied.

All Constraints are linear !



### Small example

Railway maintenance requires two jobs A and B to schedule. Job A arrives at 12.00 hrs and requires at most 5 minutes. Job B should start at least 2 minutes later than A, and must be completed within 3 minutes after completion of A. B requires at most 7 minutes and at least 2 minutes to process.

#### When to start A, and when to start B?

variables

```
t_{A}, t_{B} : start of A, B
```

 $t'_{A}$ ,  $t'_{B}$  : completion of A, B

constraints	(w.r.t.time reference $z_0$ ) $t'_A - t_A \le 5$ $t'_B - t'_A \le 3$ $t_A - t'_A \le 0$ $t'_B - t_B \le 7$		
$z_0 = 0$	$t'_A - t_A \le 5$	$t'_B - t'_A \leq 3$	
$t_A$ - $Z_0 \le 0$	$t_A - t'_A \le 0$	$t'_B - t_B \le 7$	
$z_0 - t_A \leq 0$	$t_A - t_B \le -2$	$t_B - t'_B \le -2$	



in our case z<sub>0</sub> refers to 12.00 hrs; we take this as our reference point **0** 



### Small example: STP

Railway maintenance requires two jobs A and B to schedule. Job A arrives at 12.00 hrs and requires at most 5 minutes. Job B should start at least 2 minutes later than A, and must be completed within 3 minutes after completion of A. B requires at most 7 minutes and at least 2 minutes to process.

#### When to start A, and when to start B?

variables

t <sub>A</sub> ,	t <sub>B</sub>	: start of A,	В
ιA,	LD	. Start OF7,	

 $t'_{A}$ ,  $t'_{B}$  : completion of A, B

constraints	(w.r.t.time i	reference $z_0$ )
$z_0 = 0$	$t'_A - t_A \le 5$	$t'_B - t'_A \leq 3$
$t_A$ - $Z_0 \le 0$	$t_A - t'_A \le 0$	$t'_B - t_B \le 7$
$z_0 - t_A \leq 0$	$t_A$ - $t_B \leq -2$	$t_B$ - $t'_B \le -2$



#### This is the standard representation in

Simple

Temporal

Problem





WCMC Summerschool 2013

#### Small example: Solution?



### Small example: STN

Railway maintenance requires two jobs A and B to schedule. Job A arrives at 12.00 hrs and requires at most 5 minutes. Job B should start at least 2 minutes later than A, and must be completed within 3 minutes after completion of A. B requires at most 7 minutes and at least 2 minutes to process.



#### When to start A, and when to start B?



# implied constraints

explicit constraints can be combined to imply other constraints:



strongest constraints in STP correspond to shortest paths in STN

Look at the labels of the edges as **distances** between

6

 $Z_0$ 

-2

 $\left(\right)$ 

Finding an **alternative path** comes down to identifying **another constraint**!

the corresponding nodes.



ť'A

### implied constraints

explicit constraints can be combined to imply other constraints:

constraints	some implied constraints
$t'_A - t_A \le 5$	$t'_B - t_B = (t'_B - t'_A) + (t'_A - t_A) + (t_A - t_B)$
$t_A - t_B \le -2$	≤ 3 + 5 + -2
$t_B - t'_B \le -2$	= 0
$t'_B - t'_A \leq 3$	$t'_{A} - t'_{B} = (t'_{A} - t_{A}) + (t_{A} - t_{B}) + (t_{B} - t'_{B})$
$t'_B - t_B \le 7$	$\leq 52 + -2$ = 1

strongest constraints in STP correspond to shortest paths in STN







### checking consistency

Given an STP S with its graph  $G_S$  and distance graph  $D_S$ , the following statements are equivalent:

- S is consistent

70

- D<sub>S</sub> has no negative entries on its diagonal
- G<sub>S</sub> has no negative cycles



#### original constraint matrix

 $t_{\Lambda}$   $t'_{\Lambda}$   $t_{\Box}$   $t'_{\Box}$ 

	<b>Z</b> ()	٤A	ιA	٢B	ιB
$Z_0$	0	0	5	8	8
tA	0	0	5	6	8
ť'A	8	8	0	8	3
t <sub>B</sub>	8	-2	8	0	7
ť' <sub>B</sub>	8	8	8	-2	0

#### distance matrix $D_S = [d(t,t')]$



WCMC Summerschool 2013

Given an STN S with its distance graph  $D_S$ , If  $D_S$  does not contain negative diagonal elements, then

- the set {  $t_i = D(z_0, t_i)$  : i=1,2, ..., n}  $\cup$  { $z_0 = 0$ } is a solution
- the set {  $t_i = -D(t_i, z_0)$  : i=1,2, ..., n}  $\cup$  { $z_0 = 0$ } is also a solution earliest starting times

Why

original constraint matrix

 $z_0$   $t_A$   $t'_A$   $t_B$   $t'_B$ 

distance matrix  $D_S = [d(t,t')]$ 

latest starting times

$Z_0$ 005 $\infty$ $\infty$ $t_A$ 00568 $t'_A$ $\infty$ $\infty$ 0 $\infty$ 3 $t_B$ $\infty$ -2 $\infty$ 07 $t'_B$ $\infty$ $\infty$ $\infty$ $\infty$ $-2$ 0		-0	-/ (	C / (	CD	εD	
$t_A$ 00568 $t'_A$ $\infty$ $\infty$ 0 $\infty$ 3 $t_B$ $\infty$ -2 $\infty$ 07 $t'_B$ $\infty$ $\infty$ $\infty$ $\infty$ $-2$ 0	$Z_0$	0	0	5	×	8	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	<i>t</i> <sub>A</sub>	0	0	5	6	8	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	ť'A	8	8	0	8	3	
$t'_B \propto \infty \propto -2 0$	t <sub>B</sub>	8	-2	8	0	7	
	ť'B	8	8	∞	-2	0	

t<sub>A</sub> t'<sub>A</sub> t<sub>B</sub> t'<sub>B</sub>  $Z_0$ two solutions 5 6 0  $Z_0$ 5 8 6 tΑ  $\mathbf{O}$ ťA -1 -1 0 3 1 t<sub>B</sub> all-pairs shortest -2 -2 3 6  $\mathbf{0}$ path computation ť'<sub>B</sub> -2 1 -4  $\mathbf{0}$ 35

WCMC Summerschool 2013

Breda, August 2013

 $O(n^3)$ 

Given an STN S with its distance graph  $D_S$ , If  $D_S$  does not contain negative diagonal elements, then

- the set {  $t_i = D(z_0, t_i)$  : i=1,2, ..., n}  $\cup \{z_0 = 0\}$  is a solution
- the set {  $t_i = -D(t_i, z_0) : i=1,2, ..., n$ }  $\cup \{z_0 = 0\}$  is also a solution

Why

Take an arbitrary constraint t' - t  $\leq \delta$ . We have  $D(z_0, t') \leq D(z_0, t) + D(t, t') \leq D(z_0, t) + \delta$ Hence,  $D(z_0, t') - D(z_0, t) \leq \delta$ . So the first set of solutions satisfies every constraint. Likewise,

 $D(t,z_0) \le D(t,t') + D(t',z_0) \le \delta + D(t',z_0)$ Hence,  $D(t,z_0) - D(t',z_0) \le \delta$ . So the second set of solutions satisfies every constraint, too. distance matrix  $D_S = [d(t, t')]$ 



#### Finding solutions: Example



STN (minimal) encoding two events  $t_1 \le t_2$ starting in [0,5].



for every schedule  $\sigma$ : values  $\sigma(t)$  occur between **earliest** and **latest** starting times of t.

but not all values between earliest and latest starting times constitute a schedule !



WCMC Summerschool 2013

#### Finding solutions: Example



38 **Ť**UDelft

WCMC Summerschool 2013

### Finding solutions: Example



WCMC Summerschool 2013

Breda, August 2013

39 **Ť**UDelft





start with  $t_A \in [0,0]$ ; add  $t_A = 0$ 



WCMC Summerschool 2013

sol :=  $\emptyset$ while  $T \neq \emptyset$ select some t and  $v \in [-D(t,z_0), D(z_0,t)];$ add constraint  $\{t = v\}$  to STN and update the distance matrix  $D_S$ ; remove row and column t from D; sol := sol  $\cup \{t=v\}$ 

#### distance matrix $D_S = [d(t, t')]$



```
sol := \emptyset
while T \neq \emptyset
select some t and v \in [-D(t,z_0), D(z_0,t)];
add constraint \{t = v\} to STN and update the distance matrix D_S;
remove row and column t from D;
sol := sol \cup \{t=v\}
```

#### distance matrix $D_S = [d(t, t')]$

ZO tA t'A tB t'B start with  $t_A \in [0,0]$ ; add  $t_A = 0$ 4 8 5  $\mathbf{0}$  $Z_0$ take  $t_B \in [2, 6]$ ; add  $t_B = 4$ ; update ťΑ 3 ťA -1 0 1 3 t<sub>R</sub> -4 6 0 ť'B -2 -4 1  $\mathbf{0}$ WCMC Summerschool 2013 Breda, August 2013 42

```
sol := \emptyset
while T \neq \emptyset
select some t and v \in [-D(t,z_0), D(z_0,t)];
add constraint \{t = v\} to STN and update the distance matrix D_S;
remove row and column t from D;
sol := sol \cup \{t=v\}
```

#### distance matrix $D_S = [d(t, t')]$



sol :=  $\emptyset$ while  $T \neq \emptyset$ select some t and  $v \in [-D(t,z_0), D(z_0,t)]$ ; add constraint  $\{t = v\}$  to STN and update the distance matrix  $D_S$ ; remove row and column t from D; sol := sol  $\cup \{t=v\}$ 

distance matrix  $D_S = [d(t, t')]$ 

 $z_0$   $t_A$   $t'_A$   $t_B$   $t'_B$ start with  $t_A \in [0,0]$ ; add  $t_A = 0$ 8 0  $Z_0$ take  $t_B \in [2, 6]$ ; add  $t_B = 4$ ; update tΑ take  $t'_A \in [3, 5]$ ; add  $t'_A = 3$ ; update ťA 3 0 t<sub>R</sub> ť'B -6 -1 0 WCMC Summerschool 2013 Breda, August 2013 44

 $sol := \emptyset$ while  $T \neq \emptyset$ select some t and  $v \in [-D(t,z_0), D(z_0,t)];$ add constraint  $\{t = v\}$  to STN and update the distance matrix  $D_S$ ; remove row and column *t* from *D*; sol := sol  $\cup$  {t=v}

#### distance matrix $D_S = [d(t, t')]$

8

3

0

ZO tA t'A tB t'B start with  $t_A \in [0,0]$ ; add  $t_A = 0$ З  $\mathbf{0}$  $Z_0$ take  $t_B \in [2, 6]$ ; add  $t_B = 4$ ; update tΑ take  $t'_A \in [3, 5]$ ; add  $t'_A = 3$ ; update ťA -3 0 t<sub>R</sub> ť'B -6 -1 WCMC Summerschool 2013 Breda, August 2013 45

 $sol := \emptyset$ while  $T \neq \emptyset$ select some t and  $v \in [-D(t,z_0), D(z_0,t)];$ add constraint  $\{t = v\}$  to STN and update the distance matrix  $D_S$ ; remove row and column *t* from *D*; sol := sol  $\cup$  {t=v}

#### distance matrix $D_S = [d(t, t')]$

ZO tA t'A tB t'B

start with  $t_A \in [0,0]$ ; add  $t_A = 0$  $Z_0$ add  $t_B = 4$ ; update take  $t_B \in [2, 6]$ ; tΑ add  $t'_A = 3$ ; update take  $t'_A \in [3, 5]$ ; ťA take  $t'_{B} \in [6, 6];$ add t' $_{\rm B} = 6$ t<sub>R</sub> solution s ť'B Breda, August 2013



#### What did we achieve

- we introduced a (maintenance) scheduling problem as a constraint problem: set of jobs subject to time + resource constraints that have to be completed as early as possible.
- we showed how to solve the problem if only time constraints are present (STP)
- now Bob shows how to take the resource constraints into account...
- ... that will happen after the break.



# From RCPSP to STP

Finding solutions by constraint posting











# **Constraint Posting**

Resource availability:

 $R_1 = 1$ 

Resource requirements:



6

Delft

Earliest Start Time Job k

# **Precedence Constraint Options**







WCM Summer School 2014









WCM Summer School 2014

# Basics of some heuristic

- Find resource feasible EST Schedule
  - Assume jobs start as soon as possible
  - Repeat until all resource conflicts are resolved
    - Identify existing resource conflicts
    - Select resource for which activities should be scheduled first
    - Identify sequence options between competing activities
    - Calculate best activity sequence
    - Update earliest start times
- Identify feasible job-to-job resource flows (Chaining)
- Add precedence constraints according resource flows



# **Temporal Decoupling**

Solving the independent scheduling problem in STP's



# **Temporal decoupling**

In finding solutions, until now we assumed that *one* team/actor controls the assignment of values to *all* the variables.

Suppose

- there is more than one team
- every team  $A_i$  controls a disjoint subset  $T_i$  of variables
- each team  $A_i$  wants to find a local solution to the sub-STN  $S_i$  generated by its set of time points  $T_i$ ,

This is the **distributed scheduling problem** for STN's.

We discuss an efficient solution to this problem:



**Temporal Decoupling** 





# Temporal decoupling: example

Consider the maintenance example discussed before. Suppose there are two teams. One team (A) has to job A, the other (B) job B. They would like to determine their schedule independently from each other.

Suppose:

A chooses  $Sol(S_A) \ni \{ t_A = 0, t'_A = 2 \}$ 

B chooses  $Sol(S_B) \ni \{ t_B = 3, t'_B = 6 \}$ 

Both solutions satisfy the local constraints

But  $Sol(S_A) \cup Sol(S_B) =$ 

$$\{ t_A = 0, t'_A = 2, t_B = 3, t'_B = 6 \}$$

is not a solution of S!

intuitive reason for failure:

some constraints are not implied by local constraints !



18

controlled by A



WCM Summer School 2014

# **Temporal Decoupling:**

### the method



WCM Summer School 2014

Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).





WCM Summer School 2014

Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).





Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).



If  $D(t,z_0) + D(z_0,t') > D(t,t')$  then t'- t  $\leq D(t,t')$ is *not implied* by t'-  $z_0 \leq D(z_0,t')$ ,  $z_0 - t \leq D(t,z_0)$ 



WCM Summer School 2014

Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).



If  $D(t,z_0) + D(z_0,t') > D(t,t')$  then t'- t  $\leq D(t,t')$ is *not implied* by t'-  $z_0 \leq D(z_0,t')$ ,  $z_0 - t \leq D(t,z_0)$ 

We can ensure implication of t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') by intra-team constraints by *tightening* t'- z<sub>0</sub>  $\leq$  D(z<sub>0</sub>,t') and z<sub>0</sub> - t  $\leq$  D(t,z<sub>0</sub>)



Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).



If  $D(t,z_0) + D(z_0,t') > D(t,t')$  then t'- t  $\leq D(t,t')$ is *not implied* by t'-  $z_0 \leq D(z_0,t')$ ,  $z_0 - t \leq D(t,z_0)$ 

We can ensure implication of t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') by intra-team constraints by *tightening* t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t') and  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ )

Method: Choose  $\delta_t$  and  $\delta_{t'}$  such that

- 1.  $-D(z_0,t) \le \delta_t < D(t,z_0)$
- 2.  $-D(t,z_0) \le \delta_{t'} < D(z_0,t')$

3.  $\delta_t + \delta_{t'} \leq D(t,t')$ 

Add constraints t'-  $z_0 \le \delta_{t'}$  and  $z_0 - t \le \delta_t$  to S and compute new distance matrix.



Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).



t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') implied by t'-  $z_0 \leq \delta_{t'}$  and  $z_0 - t \leq \delta_t$ 

If  $D(t,z_0) + D(z_0,t') > D(t,t')$  then t'- t  $\leq D(t,t')$ is *not implied* by t'-  $z_0 \leq D(z_0,t')$ ,  $z_0 - t \leq D(t,z_0)$ 

We can ensure implication of t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') by intra-team constraints by *tightening* t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t') and  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ )

Method: Choose  $\delta_t$  and  $\delta_{t'}$  such that

- 1.  $-D(z_0,t) \le \delta_t < D(t,z_0)$
- 2.  $-D(t,z_0) \le \delta_{t'} < D(z_0,t')$

3.  $\delta_t + \delta_{t'} \leq D(t,t')$ 

Add constraints t'-  $z_0 \le \delta_{t'}$  and  $z_0 - t \le \delta_t$  to S and compute new distance matrix.



Take an arbitrary constraint t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') such that t and t' belong to different blocks. Consider the intra-team constraints t'-  $z_0 \leq$  D( $z_0$ ,t'),  $z_0$  - t  $\leq$  D(t, $z_0$ ).



If t'- t  $\leq$  D(t,t') is *implied* by t'-  $z_0 \leq \delta_{t'}$  and  $z_0 - t \leq \delta_{t}$ , it can be removed from S without any consequence.

This procedure can be repeated for every inter team constraint not implied by intra-team constraints.

The resulting system is a **decoupled STN** 



# Summary

- We discussed the RCPSP scheduling problem specifying both time and resource constraints.
   RCPSP can be used to model maintenance scheduling problems.
- There is a method to convert the hard to solve RCPSP to a similar easy to solve STP problem containing time constraints only.
- The method to solve STP problems provides a set of solutions, from which an arbitrary solution can be chosen in an easy way. Hence flexibility in solution finding is guaranteed.
- If the problem has to be distributed over teams who want to schedule independently, there exists an efficient temporal decoupling method for STP's

